# CO<sub>2</sub>-CONCENTRATING MECHANISMS OF THE POTENTIALLY TOXIC DINOFLAGELLATE *PROTOCERATIUM RETICULATUM* (DINOPHYCEAE, GONYAULACALES)<sup>1</sup>

Simona Ratti, Mario Giordano<sup>2</sup>

Dipartimento di Scienze del Mare, Università Politecnica delle Marche, Via Brecce Bianche, 60131 Ancona, Italy

# and David Morse

Département de Sciences Biologiques, Université de Montréal, Montréal, Canada H1X 2B2

The low CO<sub>2</sub> concentration in seawater poses severe restrictions on photosynthesis, especially on those species with form II RUBISCO. We found that the potentially toxic dinoflagellate Protoceratium reticulatum Clap. et J. Lachm. possesses a form II RUBISCO. To cast some light on the mechanisms this organism undergoes to cope with low CO<sub>2</sub> availability, we compared cells grown at atmospheric (370 ppm) and high (5000 ppm) CO<sub>2</sub> concentrations, with respect to a number of physiological parameters related to dissolved inorganic carbon (DIC) acquisition and assimilation. The photosynthetic affinity for DIC was about one order of magnitude lower in cells cultivated at high [CO<sub>2</sub>]. Endpoint pH-drift experiments suggest that P. reticulatum was not able to efficiently use HCO<sub>3</sub> under our growth conditions. Only internal carbonic anhydrase (CA) activity was detected, and its activity decreased by about 60% in cells cultured at high [CO<sub>2</sub>]. Antibodies raised against a variety of algal CAs were used for Western blot analysis: P. reticulatum extracts only cross-reacted with anti-B-CA sera, and the amount of immunoreactive protein decreased in cells grown at high [CO<sub>2</sub>]. No pyrenoids were observed under all growth conditions. Our data indicate that P. reticulatum has an inducible carbonconcentrating mechanism (CCM) that operates in the absence of pyrenoids and with little intracellular CO<sub>2</sub> accumulation. Calculations on the impact of the CA activity to photosynthetic growth [CO<sub>2</sub>] suggest that it is an essential component of the CCM of P. reticulatum and is necessary to sustain the photosynthetic rates observed at ambient CO<sub>2</sub>.

*Key index words:* carbonic anhydrase; CCM; elevated CO<sub>2</sub>; HCO<sub>3</sub>; photosynthesis; pyrenoid; RUBISCO II

Abbreviations: <sup>14</sup>C-DMO, 5,5-dimethyl-2[<sup>14</sup>C]oxalidine 2,4-dione; CA, carbonic anhydrase; CCM, carbon-concentrating mechanism; DIC, dissolved inorganic carbon; eCA, extracellular carbonic anhydrase; iCA, intracellular carbonic anhydrase;  $pCO_{2}$ , partial pressure of  $CO_{2}$ ; PFD, photon flux density; PVP-40, polyvinylpyrrolidone 40

The enzyme RUBISCO catalyzes the primary fixation of inorganic carbon (Calvin and Benson 1948, Bassham and Calvin 1957, Bowes et al. 1971). Because of the relatively high  $K_M^{CO_2}$  (half-saturation constant for CO<sub>2</sub>) values of RUBISCO (Raven 1997a) and the low CO<sub>2</sub> concentration in seawater (11  $\mu$ mol·L<sup>-1</sup> at 20°C, a salinity of 30 PSU, in equilibrium with a gas phase containing 370 ppm  $CO_2$ ), photosynthesis in phytoplankton may suffer from  $CO_2$  limitation. This limitation may be especially important in phytoplankton with form II RUBISCO, which is usually characterized by a higher  $K_M^{CO_2}$  and a lower selectivity factor  $(\tau)$  than form I RUBISCO (Whitney and Andrews 1998, Giordano et al. 2005). Most microalgae overcome or reduce this limitation by activating carbon-concentrating mechanisms (CCMs; Giordano et al. 2005). A typical biophysical CCM in eukaryotic microalgae includes systems for uptake of inorganic carbon (Amoroso et al. 1998) and carbonic anhydrases (CAs), localized in the periplasmic space and/or inside the cell, which catalyze the reversible dehydration of  $HCO_3^-$  to  $CO_2$ (Badger and Price 1992, Badger and Price 1994, Giordano et al. 2005). The synergic action of all these elements typically leads to an accumulation of inorganic carbon inside the cell (Badger et al. 1998, Giordano et al. 2005).

Despite the large amount of information available for CCMs for some species, many microalgae have been largely overlooked in this respect. With rare exceptions (Berman-Frank et al. 1998, Leggat et al. 1999, Nimer et al. 1999a, Leggat et al. 2002), dinoflagellates are among these. This fact is unfortunate, because dinoflagellates are quantitatively a major component of phytoplankton in all oceans (Taylor and Pollingher 1987), and the toxic red-tideforming species can have serious repercussions on coastal ecology and human communities (Yasumoto et al. 1985, Yasumoto et al. 1987, Maclean 1989,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup>Received 6 October 2006. Accepted 8 March 2007.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup>Author for correspondence: e-mail m.giordano@univpm.it.

Murata et al. 1990, Burkholder et al. 2001, Goh et al. 2002, Ciminiello et al. 2003, Morono et al. 2003). The understanding of dinoflagellate CCMs may also provide insights into the pivotal symbiotic associations on which coral reefs are based (Rowan 1998, Goodson et al. 2001). Dinoflagellate intolerance to bubbling and the consequent difficulties in culturing them under different  $CO_2$  regimes (Juhl and Latz 2002) may have hindered laboratory studies on the CCMs of these algae.

We here report on a study conducted on the dinoflagellate Protoceratium reticulatum cultured in a specially designed system that permits culturing under different CO<sub>2</sub> regimes without the direct and damaging bubbling of the cells. Protoceratium reticulatum is an important component of phytoplankton in the Adriatic Sea (Draisci et al. 1999, Ciminiello et al. 2003) and other regions of the world (Horstman 1980, Godhe and McQuoid 2003, Joyce 2004), where it is often associated with the presence of yessotoxin and its analogues and consequent diarrheic shellfish poisoning in humans (Yasumoto et al. 1985, Ciminiello et al. 2003). Protoceratium reticulatum contains peridinin as an accessory pigment, which, to date, has always been correlated with the presence of type II RUBISCO (Morse et al. 1995, Whitney and Yellowlees 1995, Whitney and Andrews 1998). To cast some light on the strategies that this organism adopts to cope with the limited CO<sub>2</sub> availability in the ocean, we compared cell responses to growth in equilibrium with a gas phase containing either atmospheric  $CO_2$  concentration (370 ppm) or elevated  $CO_2$  (5000 ppm).

### MATERIALS AND METHODS

Cultures. The strain of P. reticulatum used for this study was kindly donated by L. Boni (University of Bologna, Bologna, Italy). Semicontinuous cultures were grown axenically in 1 L bottles filled to capacity with L1 seawater-based medium (Guillard and Hargraves 1993). The growth medium was buffered with 20 mmol  $\cdot L^{-1}$  Tris-HCl, pH 8.1, and the nitrate concentration was increased from 0.83 to  $2.5 \text{ mmol} \cdot \text{L}^{-1}$  in order to mitigate the unbalance in the external C:N ratio at the highest external [CO<sub>2</sub>] used (see below). To avoid problems related to the well-known fragility of dinoflagellates to direct bubbling of the cultures (Juhl and Latz 2002), the medium was preequilibrated with a gas phase containing either 370 ppm (air) or 5000 ppm (enriched air) CO<sub>2</sub>. The highest CO<sub>2</sub> concentration was obtained by mixing CO2-free air and 100% CO<sub>2</sub> with a gas mixer (E-5700; Bronkhorst, Hi-Tec, Ruurlo, the Netherlands). Both gases were passed through a  $17 \text{ cm} \times 6 \text{ cm}$ column packed with silica gel to eliminate water vapor. The removal of water was necessary because the gas mixer worked on the basis of mass rather than gas volume. The growth medium was vigorously bubbled for 12 h with the gas mixture without any observable volume changes. The cells were then inoculated at a density of approximately 4000 cells · mL<sup>-1</sup>, and the bottle was sealed. The  $CO_2$  and dissolved inorganic carbon (DIC) in the medium were checked at the beginning and end of the experiments using an ADC 2250 Series infrared gas analyzer (ADC Bioscientific Ltd., Herds, UK) and were found to be initially at the expected level for the set pH and temperature (at 370 ppm:  $\dot{CO}_2 \approx 0.012 \text{ mmol} \cdot L^{-1}$ ,  $\dot{HCO}_3 \approx$ 

1.9 mmol·L<sup>-1</sup>, and DIC  $\approx$  2 mmol·L<sup>-1</sup>; at 5000 ppm: CO<sub>2</sub>  $\approx$  0.16 mmol·L<sup>-1</sup>, HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>  $\approx$  25 mmol·L<sup>-1</sup>, and DIC  $\approx$ 28 mmol· $L^{-1}$ ; see below for details on the calculations of DIC speciation) and not to vary appreciably during the experiments. Cultures were maintained at 20°C, under a continuous photon flux density (PFD) of 120  $\mu$ mol photons  $\cdot$  m<sup>-1</sup>  $\cdot$  s<sup>-1</sup>, provided by cool-white fluorescent tubes. This light regime was chosen to avoid culture synchronization and after verifying that this treatment had no substantial effect on growth rate and cell morphology and ultrastructure. To verify whether pyrenoid formation was affected by the light regimes, some cultures were exposed to 12:12 light:dark (L:D) cycles. All experiments were carried out on cells in the exponential growth phase, allowed to grow at the given CO<sub>2</sub> concentration for at least four generations prior to any measurement. After a preliminary determination of the growth rate (see below), cultures for all subsequent experiments were diluted after a time corresponding to one doubling.

Growth rate determination. Cell density was estimated with a Sedgwick-Rafter chamber (McAlice 1971). The specific growth rate,  $\mu$ , was derived by daily counts of exponentially growing cells acclimated for at least four generations to the CO<sub>2</sub> growth regime. Acclimated cells were inoculated at a cell density of approximately 500 cells  $\cdot$ mL<sup>-1</sup>, in 1 L of L1 medium preequilibrated with the appropriate gas phase. Growth rate determination was effected on a minimum of six distinct cultures for each condition. The daily opening of bottles for cell counts may cause a loss of CO<sub>2</sub> from the medium equilibrated with the high partial pressure of CO<sub>2</sub> (pCO<sub>2</sub>) gas phase; we therefore designed a system that allowed us to withdraw samples from the bottles with a syringe, while adding the appropriate gas phase to the air space of the bottle.

Chlorophyll and total protein determination. Chlorophyll was extracted in a mixture of 20% (v/v) tetrahydrofuran and 80% (v/v) methanol, and the concentrations of total chl, chl a, and chl c were determined according to Jeffrey and Humphrey (1975). Total proteins were measured with the method described by Peterson (1977).

CA-activity assay. Cells in the midexponential growth phase were harvested by filtration on 11 µm nylon filters (Millipore, Billerica, MA, USA) and subjected to two sequential extractions to determine the distribution of CA activity between the soluble and insoluble fractions (Karlsson et al. 1995). The cells were resuspended in an extraction medium containing 300 mmo-l·L<sup>-1</sup> Tris-borate (pH 8.36), 5 mmol·L<sup>-1</sup> EDTA, 2.5 mmol·L<sup>-1</sup> diothiothreitol (DTT), 2% (w/v) PVP-40, 0.1% (w/v) TRITON X-100, and 0.5% (w/v) BSA (Giordano and Maberly 1989) and lysed with a Ten-Broek homogenizer, on ice. The slurry was centrifuged for 7 min at 12,000g and 4°C, and the supernatant was used for soluble CA-activity determination. The pellet was subjected to a further extraction, in an extraction medium similar to the one described above, supplemented with  $10 \ \mu mol \cdot L^{-1} \ ZnCl_2$  and  $200 \ mmol \cdot L^{-1} \ KCl$  (Karlsson et al. 1995). The suspension was stirred on ice for 2 h and then centrifuged for  $7 \min$  at 12,000g and 4°C. This supernatant was used for the determination of "insoluble" CA activity. Intact cells and crude cell extracts were assayed for extracellular CA (eCA) and total CA by the potentiometric method of Wilbur and Anderson (1948) as modified by Miyachi et al. (1983). The assay mixture contained 25 mmol·L<sup>-1</sup> phosphate buffer, pH 8.36, and 10  $\mu$ mol·L<sup>-1</sup> ZnCl<sub>2</sub>. In control experiments, cell extract and cell suspension were substituted with an equal volume of either phosphate buffer (for eCA) or boiled extract [for intracellular CA (iCA)].

*Estimates of CA catalytic rates:* The activity of iCA measured by the Wilbur–Anderson method was converted into rate of  $CO_2$  hydration and  $HCO_3^-$  dehydration by an extension (U. Riebesell, personal communication) of the procedure described by Hatch and Burnell (1990). The CA activities ( $a_{CA}$ ) expressed as catalytic rates of  $CO_2$  hydration and  $HCO_3^-$  dehydration were determined according to the following equation:

$$a_{\rm CA} = \frac{C_{\rm buffer}}{t_{\rm s}} - \frac{C_{\rm buffer}}{t_{\rm o}} = \text{mol}\,{\rm CO}_2 \cdot {\rm s}^{-1} \tag{1}$$

where  $C_{\text{buffer}}$  is the buffering capacity of the assay mix, and  $t_{\text{s}}$  and  $t_{\text{o}}$  are the times required for the chosen pH variation in the presence and absence of the sample, respectively. The buffering capacity of the solution was determined by titration with a standard HCl solution. Considering that dH<sup>+</sup>/dt =  $-\text{dCO}_2/\text{d}t$ ,  $a_{\text{CA}}$  units are mol CO<sub>2</sub>·s<sup>-1</sup>. The  $a_{\text{CA}}$  value, divided by the cell concentration in the reaction mixture, yields the rate in units of mol CO<sub>2</sub> catalyzed cell<sup>-1</sup>·s<sup>-1</sup>.

These catalytic rates, obtained at saturating CO<sub>2</sub>, were converted to the catalytic rates in culture conditions by a three-step procedure. First, the expected activity for one unit of enzyme ( $a_{CAm}$ ) was calculated from the Michaelis–Menten kinetics according to equation 2 (Pocker and Deits 1984):

$$a_{\rm CAm} = \frac{k_{\rm cat}^{\rm CO_2} [\rm CO_2]_{\rm assay}}{K_M^{\rm CO_2} + [\rm CO_2]_{\rm assay}}$$
(2)

where  $k_{cat}^{CO_2}$  is the catalytic rate constant,  $K_M^{CO_2}$  is the half-saturation constants, and  $[CO_2]_{assay}$  is the  $CO_2$  concentration used in the assay. The measured activity ( $a_{CA}$ ) was then divided by the Michaelis–Menten predicted activity ( $a_{CAm}$ ) to obtain the CA content per cell ( $C_{CA}$ ). Finally, forward (CA-catalyzed hydration rate,  $a_{CA}^{CO_2}$ ) and reverse (CA-catalyzed dehydration rate,  $a_{CA}^{HCO_3^-}$ ) reaction rates in vivo were estimated from the  $C_{CA}$  activity using the following equations:

$$a_{\rm CA}^{\rm CO_2} = C_{\rm CA} \frac{k_{\rm cat}^{\rm CO_2} [\rm CO_2]}{K_M^{\rm CO_2} + [\rm CO_2]}$$
(3)

$$a_{\rm CA}^{\rm HCO_3^-} = C_{\rm CA} \frac{k_{\rm cat}^{\rm HCO_3^-} [\rm HCO_3^-]}{K_M^{\rm HCO_3^-} + [\rm HCO_3^-]}$$
(4)

where  $k_{cat}^{CO_2}$  and  $k_{cat}^{HCO_3^-}$  are the catalytic rate constants,  $K_M^{CO_2}$  and  $K_M^{HCO_3^-}$  are the half-saturation constants, and  $[CO_2]$  and  $[HCO_3^-]$  are the intracellular CO<sub>2</sub> and HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> concentrations. The catalytic rate constants used were those for higher plant intracellular  $\beta$ -CAs:  $k_{cat}^{CO_2} = 4.6 \times 10^5 \cdot \text{s}^{-1}$  is that of *Pisum sativum* CA (Johansson and Forsman 1993);  $k_{cat}^{HCO_3^-} = 3.4 \times 10^5 \cdot \text{s}^{-1}$  is that of *Spinacia oleracea* CA (Pocker and Miksch 1978). The  $K_M$  values used were those reported by Graham et al. (1984) for higher plant intracellular  $\beta$ -CAs, with typical values of about 30 mmol·L<sup>-1</sup>. The effect of temperature on the rates was estimated assuming that the  $Q_{10}$  was equal to that for maize CA (Burnell and Hatch 1988).

PAGE and Western blotting. Cell-free extracts, obtained as described in the paragraph on CA-activity determination, were loaded on 12% (v/v) SDS-PAGE gels (Laemmli 1970) in a Mini-Protean III slab-gel apparatus (Bio-Rad, Hercules, CA, USA). After SDS-PAGE, gels were equilibrated for 10 min in a transfer buffer [200 mM NaHCO<sub>3</sub>, 60 mM Na<sub>2</sub>CO<sub>3</sub>, 20% (v/v) methanol]; the polypeptides were then transferred electrophoretically to a nitrocellulose membrane (Extra Blotting Sartorius, Goettingen, Germany) at 250 mA for 4 h at 4°C, using a Mini Trans-Blot Cell (Bio-Rad). Immune reactions on the blots were visualized after incubation with a horseradish peroxidaselinked secondary antibody using enhanced chemoluminescence (ECL kit; Amersham Pharmacia Biotech, Piscataway, NJ, USA). The primary antibodies used for Western blots were raised against RUBISCO type I of Chlamydomonas reinhardtii P. A. Dang., RUBISCO type II of Gonyaulax sp., cytosolic β-CA of Coccomyxa sp. (CoCA) and mitochondrial  $\beta$ -CA of C. reinhardtii (mtCA; kindly donated by G. Samuelsson, Umeå University,

Sweden), chloroplast  $\beta$ -CA of *Phaeodactylum tricornutum* Bohlin (PtCA; kindly donated by Y. Matsuda, Kwansei-Gakuin University, Sanda, Hyogo, Japan), and  $\alpha$ -CA of *Thalassiosira weissflogii* (Grunow) G. Fryxell et Hasle (TwCA; kindly donated by F. M. M Morel, Princeton University, Princeton, NJ, USA). The hybridized membranes were scanned in reflection with a Sharp JX-300 scanner (Sharp Electronics Corporation, Mahwah, NJ, USA) and analyzed densitometrically with the Image Master 1D software (Amersham Biosciences).

Electron microscopy. Protoceratium reticulatum cells were taken from different culture conditions, washed with 0.4 M PBS, and fixed with 3% glutaraldehyde in 0.4 M PBS for 30 min without osmium to preserve antigenicity on the sections. The fixed cells were washed three times in PBS and water, dehydrated with a standard ethanol series, and embedded in LR White resin (EMS, Hatfield, PA, USA) polymerized for 24 h at 60°C in gelatin capsules. Thin sections were cut for TEM, poststained with uranyl acetate, and observed using a JEOL JEM 100S microscope (JEOL, Tokyo, Japan) operating at 80 kV. Antibodies raised against the cytosolic  $\beta$ -CA of Coccomyxa sp (anti-CoCA) or the chloroplastic  $\beta$ -CA of *Ph. tricornutum* (anti-PtCA) were tested for immunolabeling at concentrations (1/100 and 1/200 for anti-CoCA; 1/50 and 1/100 for anti-PtCA) roughly 10 times those used to obtain signals on Western blots. As a secondary antibody, 20 nm gold-labeled IgG (BBInternational, Cardiff, UK) was tested at 1/50, 1/100, and 1/200 dilutions; no specific labeling of the cell sections was observed under any condition with either antibody.

Gas-exchange measurements. Photosynthetic O<sub>2</sub> evolution was measured with a Clark-type O<sub>2</sub> electrode (Chloroview 2; Hansatech, King's Lynn, UK). Cells in the exponential growth phase were harvested by gravity filtration on 11 µm nylon filters (Millipore), resuspended at a density of  $1.5-2 \times 10^5$  cell  $\cdot$  mL<sup>-1</sup> in DIC-free culture medium, placed in the O2 electrode chamber, and stirred at the slowest rate allowed by the system to avoid mechanical damage to the cells. The chamber was closed, and the light turned on at a saturating (for growth and photosynthesis) PFD of 470  $\mu mol$  photons  $\cdot m^{-2} \cdot s^{-1}$  provided by a red (660 nm) light-emitting diode source (Hansatech). The measurements were carried out at a temperature of 20°C. The cells were allowed to reach the CO<sub>2</sub> compensation point. The rate of  $O_2$  evolution was then measured, following the sequential addition of incremental NaHCO<sub>3</sub> aliquots. Respiratory rates were determined in the same system by measuring O<sub>2</sub> consumption in the dark, 5 min after the onset of darkness.

*pH-drift experiments.* The pH-drift experiments were carried out to investigate whether *P. reticulatum* was able to use  $\text{HCO}_3^$ as a source of DIC for photosynthesis. Cells in the exponential growth phase were harvested by gravity filtration on 11 µm nylon filters (Millipore) and resuspended, at a cell density of 4000 cells · mL<sup>-1</sup>, in unbuffered growth medium. The initial pH of the medium was adjusted to 8.1 with HCl. Glass vials were filled to capacity (8 mL) with this cell suspension and closed tightly with screw caps. Cells were incubated in the same conditions used for growth until pH was stable (usually after 24 h of incubation).

*DIC speciation.* Inorganic carbon speciation was calculated using the dissociation constants in Goyet and Poisson (1989), the measured pH, temperature, and salinity, and the concentration of dissolved  $CO_2$  calculated according to Henry's law for the appropriate conditions (Weiss 1974). For the pH drift experiments, the alkalinity was determined by Gran tritration, and the concentration of DIC species was calculated according to Maberly (1996), using the dissociation constants of Goyet and Poisson (1989) for the salinity of the growth medium.

Silicone oil centrifugation. The silicone oil centrifugation technique was used to estimate the intracellular concentration of inorganic carbon, the internal pH, and the cell volume. Cells in the exponential growth phase were treated as described in the previous paragraph and allowed to reach the CO<sub>2</sub> compensation point in the O2 electrode chamber. The intracellular concentration of DIC was determined by a slight modification of the method described by Leggat et al. (1999). Two-hundred microliters of a cell suspension with a density of  $2.5 \times 10^5$  cell · mL<sup>-1</sup> was transferred into a 400 µL tube (Starlab, Ahrensburg, Germany) containing 100 µL of silicone oil mixture (AR200:AR20 = 2:1; Sigma-Aldrich, St. Louis, MO, USA) layered over 20 µL of killing solution (1 M NaOH and 10% v/v MeOH). Cells were then preilluminated for 2 min with a saturating PFD of 470  $\mu mol$  photons  $\cdot\,m^{-2}\cdot\,s^{-1}.$  Subsequently, a NaH  $^{14}CO_3$  (Amersham, Little Chalfont, UK) solutions of the saturation of the saturatio tion with a working specific activity of 74  $GBq \cdot mol^{-1}$  was added to the cell suspension. Cells were incubated in the presence of this solution for 30 s, at the same PFD used for the preillumination, prior to being spun at 12000g for 20 s through the silicone oil mixture and into the killing solution. Total extracellular and intracellular volumes were calculated after a 1 h incubation in the presence of <sup>3</sup>H<sub>2</sub>O (specific activity 162 KBq $\cdot$ mL<sup>-1</sup>; Amersham) followed by a 10 s incubation with a <sup>14</sup>C-mannitol solution (specific activity 2.18 GBq mmol<sup>-1</sup>; Amersham; Badger et al. 1980). The intracellular pH was measured after 15 min of incubation with 14.8 KBq $\cdot$ mL<sup>-1</sup> 5,5-dimethyl-2[<sup>14</sup>C]oxalidine 2,4-dione (<sup>14</sup>C-DMO; specific activity 1850 MBq·mmol<sup>-1</sup>; Amersham; Badger et al. 1980). These incubation times were chosen after careful preliminary trials, to ensure that <sup>3</sup>H<sub>2</sub>O and <sup>14</sup>C-DMO were in equilibrium between the inside and the outside of the cells and to minimize the risk of <sup>14</sup>C-mannitol entry into the cells.

*Statistics.* The data are expressed as the mean  $\pm$  standard deviation of measurements obtained from at least three distinct cultures. Statistical significance of differences was determined with one-tailed *t*-test, with the significance level set at 0.05.

#### RESULTS

Growth and cell size, and chl and protein content. Specific growth rates were significantly higher in cells grown in high CO<sub>2</sub>, with  $\mu$  values 1.4-fold higher than those of cells grown in low CO<sub>2</sub> (Table 1). Neither cell volume (Table 1) nor protein or chl content (Table 2) was appreciably affected by the pCO<sub>2</sub> in the gas phase in equilibrium with the growth medium (P > 0.05).

Cell ultrastructure. Protoceratium reticulatum contained numerous chloroplasts, both adjacent to the nucleus and more peripherally (Fig. S1, a, see supplementary material), similar to plastids in Amphidinium (Jenks and Gibbs 2000) and Gonyaulax (Nassoury et al. 2001), respectively. However, unlike these other dinoflagellates, pyrenoids were not observed in the plastids of *P. reticulatum* grown

TABLE 1. Specific growth rate ( $\mu$ ) and cell volume of *Protoceratium reticulatum* cells cultivated in media in equilibrium with gas phases containing either 370 or 5000 ppm of CO<sub>2</sub>.

| pCO <sub>2</sub> (ppm) | $\mu~(d^{-1})$  | Cell volume (µm <sup>3</sup> ) |  |  |
|------------------------|-----------------|--------------------------------|--|--|
| 370                    | $0.14 \pm 0.06$ | $2733 \pm 919$                 |  |  |
| 5000                   | 0.20 ± 0.02     | $2786 \pm 915$                 |  |  |

The results are shown as the means  $\pm$  SD of measurements carried out on six (growth rate) or three (cell size) distinct cultures. pCO<sub>2</sub>, partial pressure of CO<sub>2</sub>.

TABLE 2. Total chl, chl *a* and *c*, and total protein of *Protoceratium reticulatum* cells cultured in a media equilibrated with a gas phase containing either 370 or 5000 ppm of  $CO_2$ .

|                        | Total protain          | Chl a           | Chl c                 | Total chl       |
|------------------------|------------------------|-----------------|-----------------------|-----------------|
| pCO <sub>2</sub> (ppm) | $(ng \cdot cell^{-1})$ |                 | $(pg\cdot cell^{-1})$ |                 |
| 370                    | $0.80\pm0.21$          | $6.01 \pm 0.68$ | $2.82 \pm 1.03$       | $8.82 \pm 1.45$ |
| 5000                   | $0.81 \pm 0.27$        | $5.87 \pm 0.94$ | $3.75 \pm 2.93$       | $9.62 \pm 2.76$ |

Values shown are the means  $\pm$  SD of determination effected on five distinct cultures. pCO<sub>2</sub>, partial pressure of CO<sub>2</sub>.

under constant light at either atmospheric or elevated CO<sub>2</sub> concentration (Fig. S1, b and c, see supplementary material). Cells were also grown under L:D cycles, as these conditions have been observed to influence pyrenoid formation in other microalgae (Nassoury et al. 2001, Cook et al. 1976). However, no pyrenoid was observed in P. reticulatum cells cultured under these conditions (Fig. S1, d-g, see supplementary material). Cells grown under L:D cycles appeared to contain less vacuolar space and proportionally more cytoplasm (Fig. S1, see supplementary material), but time of day following entrainment to L:D cycles did not affect either the distribution of plastids within the cells (Fig. S1, d and f, see supplementary material) or the spacing between thylakoid stacks (Fig. S1, e and g, see supplementary material).

CA. To determine if photosynthetic performance could be correlated with CA activity, the activity of these enzymes was measured for both intact cells and crude extracts (Table 3). No CA activity was detected outside the intact cells or in the insoluble fraction of crude extracts, regardless of the CO<sub>2</sub> concentration used for growth. The only CA activity detected was associated with the soluble fraction of cell extracts (iCA): this activity, expressed in Wilbur-Anderson units, was 3-fold higher in cells acclimated to atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> concentration than in those cultured in a medium equilibrated with a gas phase with a  $pCO_2$  of 5000 ppm. Wilbur-Anderson units, however, are not satisfactory if the quantitative contribution of CA activity to photosynthesis and CCM is to be assessed. We therefore converted these units into catalytic rates and determined that the

TABLE 3. Extracellular and intracellular carbonic anhydrase (CA) activity in cells of *Protoceratium reticulatum* cultivated in equilibrium with gas phases containing either  $370 \text{ or } 5000 \text{ ppm CO}_2$ .

| pCO <sub>2</sub> (ppm) | eCA activity | Soluble iCA activity $(WAU \times 10^9 \text{ cell})$ | Insoluble<br>iCA activity |
|------------------------|--------------|---|---------------------------|
| 370                    | n.d.         | $6.8 \pm 1.1$   | n.d.                      |
| 5000                   | n.d.         | $2.5 \pm 2.3$   | n.d.                      |

The values are the means  $\pm$  SD of four independent replicates. eCA, extracellular carbonic anhydrase; iCA, intracellular carbonic anhydrase; pCO<sub>2</sub>, partial pressure of CO<sub>2</sub>; WAU, Wilbur–Anderson units; n.d., not detected.

TABLE 4. Catalytic rates of intracellular carbonic anhydrase (CA) in cells of *Protoceratium reticulatum* cultivated at either 370 or 5000 ppm of CO<sub>2</sub> in the gas phase.

| pCO <sub>2</sub> (ppm) | $a_{\mathrm{CA}}^{\mathrm{HCO}_{3}^{-}}*$ (pmol $\cdot$ cell <sup>-1</sup> $\cdot$ s <sup>-1</sup> ) | $a_{\mathrm{CA}}^{\mathrm{CO}_2} st \ \mathrm{(pmol} \cdot \mathrm{cell}^{-1} \cdot \mathrm{s}^{-1})$ | $\begin{array}{c} CA \ content \\ (fmol \cdot cell^{-1}) \end{array}$ |
|------------------------|--|---|---|
| 370<br>5000            | $329 \pm 188$<br>$69.9 \pm 70.1$   | $\begin{array}{c} 0.62 \pm 0.35 \\ 0.20 \pm 0.22 \end{array}$   | $7.65 \pm 4.40$<br>$9.61 \pm 0.10$                                    |

 $a_{CA}^{HCO_3^-}$ , CA-catalyzed rates of  $HCO_3^-$  dehydration;  $a_{CA}^{CO_2}$ , CA-catalyzed rates of CO<sub>2</sub> hydration; pCO<sub>2</sub>, partial pressure of CO<sub>2</sub>. The values are the means ± SD (n = 4).

\*Catalytic rates were calculated using  $CO_2$  and  $HCO_3^-$  intracellular concentration values determined by silicon oil centrifugation experiments.

CA-catalyzed rate of  $HCO_3^-$  dehydration was greater than the CA-catalyzed rate of  $CO_2$  hydration in both cells grown in low  $CO_2$  and high  $CO_2$  (Table 4; P < 0.05). More interestingly, the catalytic rate of  $HCO_3^-$  dehydration was 10-fold higher in cells grown in low  $CO_2$  than in their counterparts grown in high  $CO_2$  (Table 4; P < 0.05).

To confirm these findings, both the soluble fraction and the insoluble fraction of the extracts were subjected to immunoblot analysis using antibodies raised against CAs from different microalgae. No cross-reaction was observed with the insoluble fraction of *P. reticulatum* extracts. Instead, a 45 kDa polypeptide in the soluble fraction cross-reacted with both the antibodies raised against CoCA and



FIG. 1. Abundance of carbonic anhydrase (CA) protein in cells of *Protoceratium reticulatum* cultivated in medium equilibrated with gas phases containing either 370 or 5000 ppm of CO<sub>2</sub>. The immunodetection was carried out with antibody directed toward the  $\beta$ -CA of *Phaeodactylum tricornutum* (PtCA; upper panel) and the  $\beta$ -CA of *Coccomyxa* sp. (CoCA; middle panel), and antibody raised against the form II RUBISCO of *Gonyaulax* sp. (GpRUB; lower panel) as a reference.

those raised against PtCA (Fig. 1). No hybridization of *P. reticulatum* polypeptides was detected with antibodies directed against mtCA of *C. reinhardtii* and TwCA.

*RUBISCO.* Figure 1 shows a typical Western blot obtained with *P. reticulatum* crude extract hybridized with an antibody raised against RUBISCO type II of *Gonyaulax* sp. This analysis confirmed the presence of type II RUBISCO in *P. reticulatum*, as was expected on the basis of the presence of peridinin as an accessory pigment (Morse et al. 1995, Whitney and Yellowlees 1995, Whitney and Andrews 1998). The densitometric quantification of the hybridization bands afforded very similar results for cells grown at either air or elevated CO<sub>2</sub> concentration (P > 0.05). No immunological reaction was detected when *P. reticulatum* polypeptides were exposed to anti-*Chlamydomonas* type I RUBISCO serum.

Photosynthesis and respiration. Table 5 summarizes the main photosynthetic parameters for cells cultured in media equilibrated with either 370 or 5000 ppm CO<sub>2</sub>.  $P_{\text{max}}$  remained essentially unaffected by  $CO_2$  availability during growth (P > 0.05). The affinity of photosynthesis for CO<sub>2</sub>, instead, was significantly (P < 0.05) higher in cells grown in low CO<sub>2</sub>, whether expressed as  $K_{1/2}$  (~7-fold lower) or as CO<sub>2</sub> conductance (4.5-fold higher). Furthermore, in cells grown in low CO<sub>2</sub>, photosynthesis was saturated at a CO<sub>2</sub> concentration of 40  $\mu$ mol  $\cdot$  L<sup>-1</sup>, which was almost 20% lower than the  $CO_2$  concentration necessary to attain saturation of photosynthesis in cells grown at high CO<sub>2</sub> (P < 0.05). The CO<sub>2</sub> compensation points, however, were similar for cells cultured in the two CO<sub>2</sub> growth regimes (~0.2  $\mu$ mol·L<sup>-1</sup>; P > 0.05). Oxygen consumption rates were not influenced by the CO<sub>2</sub> available during growth (Table 5; P > 0.005).

*pH-drift experiments.* Cells grown in low CO<sub>2</sub> were able to increase the pH of their medium up to a maximum value of  $8.32 \pm 0.03$  (Fig. 2). Alkalinity did not change significantly during the incubation and was equal to ~1.6 mEq·L<sup>-1</sup>. On the contrary, the CO<sub>2</sub> concentration declined by 2.5-fold over the duration of the experiment, reaching a final concentration of  $4.5 \pm 3.1 \,\mu$ mol·L<sup>-1</sup>. In addition, HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-1</sup> (final concentration =  $1.24 \pm 0.44 \,\text{mmol·L}^{-1}$ ) and DIC (final concentration =  $1.40 \pm 0.52 \,\text{mmol·L}^{-1}$ ) decreased by about 2-fold (Fig. 2; P < 0.05). Cells grown in high CO<sub>2</sub> showed

TABLE 5. Photosynthetic parameters of *Protoceratium reticulatum* cells in response to changes in pCO<sub>2</sub> in the gas phase.

|              | $P_{\rm max}$   | R   | $K_{1/2(\text{DIC})}$         | $K_{1/2(CO_2)}$   | $\Gamma_{(DIC)}$  | $\Gamma_{({\rm CO}_2)}$                                       | $S_{(DIC)}$   | $S_{(CO_2)}$  | $\alpha_{({\rm CO}_2)}$                                       | $\alpha$ (DIC)                            |
|--------------|---|---|-------------------------------|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| pCO<br>(ppm) | (pmol O <sub>2</sub>  | $\cdot h^{-1} \cdot cell^{-1}$ )                              |                               |   | (µmol   | $ \cdot L^{-1})$  |   |   | $(pmol O_2 \cdot l mmol^{-1})$                                | $h^{-1} \cdot cell^{-1} \cdot \cdot OIC)$ |
| 370<br>5000  | $\begin{array}{c} 3.14 \pm 0.54 \\ 2.70 \pm 0.14 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{l}-2.59 \pm 0.31 \\ -2.90 \pm 0.46\end{array}$ | $236 \pm 198 \\ 2046 \pm 680$ | $\begin{array}{c} 1.66 \pm 1.42 \\ 11.5 \pm 3.88 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{c} 37.0 \pm 17.1 \\ 32.6 \pm 21.1 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{c} 0.20 \pm 0.08 \\ 0.17 \pm 0.11 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{c} 6000 \pm 707 \\ 7500 \pm 577 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{c} 40.0 \pm 7.07 \\ 47.5 \pm 5.00 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{c} 2.10 \pm 0.43 \\ 0.46 \pm 0.02 \end{array}$ | $3.99 \pm 126$<br>$81.7 \pm 3.71$         |

*R*, dark respiration;  $\Gamma$ , CO<sub>2</sub>/HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> compensation point of photosynthesis;  $\alpha$ , CO<sub>2</sub>/HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> conductance of photosynthesis; *S*, CO<sub>2</sub>/HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> saturation point of photosynthesis; pCO<sub>2</sub>, partial pressure of CO<sub>2</sub>. Values are means ± SD (*n* = 4).



FIG. 2. Results of end-point pH-drift experiments conducted on *Protoceratium reticulatum* cultivated in media equilibrated with gas phases containing either 370 or 5000 ppm of  $CO_2$ . The black bars show the mean value at the beginning of the experiment; the white bars show the mean value at the end of the experiment. The error bars show the standard deviations (n = 3).

a pH compensation point of  $8.33 \pm 0.01$  (Fig. 2), with a 1.6-fold decrease in alkalinity (final alkalinity =  $2.6 \pm 0.6 \text{ mEq} \cdot \text{L}^{-1}$ ). The CO<sub>2</sub> concentration in the incubation medium declined from  $21.0 \pm$  $4.31 \,\mu\text{mol} \cdot \text{L}^{-1}$  to  $11.1 \pm 3.49 \,\mu\text{mol} \cdot \text{L}^{-1}$ ; HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> (final concentration =  $2.0 \pm 0.5 \,\text{mmol} \cdot \text{L}^{-1}$ ) and DIC (final concentration =  $2.0 \pm 0.1 \,\text{mmol} \cdot \text{L}^{-1}$ ) concentrations decreased by 60% and 50%, respectively (Fig. 2; P < 0.05).

Internal inorganic carbon concentration. The silicone oil centrifugation data showed that cells cultivated at 5000 ppm CO<sub>2</sub> contained the amount of inorganic carbon expected if they were in equilibrium with the medium, while the cells cultured at atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> concentration showed a consistent but rather limited (1.5-fold) accumulation of inorganic carbon (Table 6; P < 0.05).

#### DISCUSSION

When compared to the work on the CCMs of green microalgae and, to some extent, diatoms, the investigations of dinoflagellate CCMs are scant and usually not performed with a classical comparison between cells grown in low and high  $CO_2$ . Our data were collected to fill in these gaps.

*Protoceratium reticulatum* is a peridinin-containing "red" dinoflagellate expected to contain form II RUBISCO. This expectation was confirmed by the specific immunological reaction of a protein extract

of P. reticulatum with an anti-form-II RUBISCO (Fig. 1). Since the selectivity factor of RUBISCO II for CO<sub>2</sub>, measured in different species of dinoflagellates, is unable to support a positive photosynthetic budget at atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> levels (Raven and Johnston 1991, Whitney and Andrews 1998), algae with this type of RUBISCO require a CCM to support growth (Badger and Price 1994, Leggat et al. 1999, Nimer et al. 1999a, Clark and Flynn 2000, Colman et al. 2002, Dason et al. 2004). Our results are compatible with this idea: cells grown in low CO<sub>2</sub> are appreciably more efficient at using subsaturating concentrations of DIC than cells grown in high CO<sub>2</sub>, as shown by the almost 10-fold lower  $K_{1/2}(CO_2, DIC)$  and 5-fold lower  $CO_2$  conductivity in cells grown in low CO<sub>2</sub> than in cells cultured at high  $CO_{2}$  (Table 5). The extent of this variation is similar to that observed in organisms whose CCMs are usually considered very efficient (Giordano and Bowes 1997, Rost et al. 2003). This not withstanding, we were only able to observe a very limited accumulation of CO<sub>2</sub> inside cells grown in low CO<sub>2</sub>, while no accumulation was detected in cells cultured at 5000 ppm (Table 6). The low amount of CO<sub>2</sub> accumulated in *P. reticulatum* cells grown in low CO<sub>2</sub> might be thought inconsistent with the presence of a CCM. However, the fact that similar results were obtained for algae with obviously active CCMs (Berman-Frank et al. 1994, 1998, Raven 1997b, Leggat et al. 1999, Nimer et al. 1999a) and the disequilibrium theory proposed by Raven (1997b) suggest that a large  $CO_{2}$  accumulation is not necessary for a CCM to work effectively. While this theory is most easily understood for algae with a pyrenoid, Morita et al. (1998) also used it to explain the function of a CCM in some pyrenoidless microalgae with low intracellular CO<sub>2</sub> accumulation. Pyrenoids are often present in dinoflagellates (Dodge 1975, Schnepf and Elbrächter 1999), and their formation and disassembly, at least in Gonyau*lax* sp., has been found to correlate with  $CO_2$ fixation rates (Nassoury et al. 2001, 2005). The P. reticulatum cells used for this study, however, did not contain pyrenoids, regardless of the CO<sub>2</sub> concentration available or entrainment to L:D cycles (Fig. S1, see supplementary material). This finding is a further indication that the presence of a pyrenoid is not essential for CCM activity (Morita et al. 1998, Giordano et al. 2005, Raven et al. 2005).

TABLE 6. Accumulation of inorganic carbon in cells of *Protoceratium reticulatum* cultivated at either ambient (370 ppm) or elevated (5000 ppm)  $pCO_2$ .

| pCO <sub>2</sub> (ppm) | DICout                         | DIC <sub>in</sub>               | DIC <sub>in</sub> /DIC <sub>out</sub>                         | $\rm CO_{2out}$   | $CO_{2in}$  | $\rm CO_{2in}/\rm CO_{2out}$                                  | $\mathrm{pH}_{\mathrm{out}}$                                  | $\mathrm{pH}_{\mathrm{in}}$        |
|------------------------|--------------------------------|---------------------------------|---|---|---|---|---|------------------------------------|
| 370<br>5000            | $533 \pm 67.6 \\ 419 \pm 25.0$ | $796 \pm 184$<br>$118 \pm 79.5$ | $\begin{array}{c} 1.51 \pm 0.39 \\ 0.28 \pm 0.17 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{c} 1.97 \pm 0.25 \\ 3.15 \pm 0.18 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{c} 1.19 \pm 0.27 \\ 0.31 \pm 0.23 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{c} 0.60 \pm 0.16 \\ 0.11 \pm 0.07 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{l} 8.28 \pm 0.00 \\ 8.00 \pm 0.00 \end{array}$ | $8.61 \pm 0.00$<br>$8.38 \pm 0.00$ |

 $\text{DIC}_{out},$   $\text{DIC}_{in},$   $\text{CO}_{2out}$  and  $\text{CO}_{2in}$  values are expressed in  $\mu\text{mol}\cdot\text{L}^{-1}.$ 

The subscripts "in" and "out" identify the compartment (either intracellular or extracellular) to which the data refer. The values are the means  $\pm$  SD (n = 3). pCO<sub>2</sub>, partial pressure of CO<sub>2</sub>.

The distribution and role of CAs in dinoflagellates is still not entirely clear. Most of the dinoflagellates studied so far show very little CA activity on their surface (Colman et al. 2002, Dason et al. 2004, Rost et al. 2006), although external CA activity was detected in some studies (Berman-Frank et al. 1994, 1995, Nimer et al. 1997, 1999a,b). In contrast, internal CA activity was found in all dinoflagellates assayed (Berman-Frank et al. 1994, Leggat et al. 1999, Dason et al. 2004, Rost et al. 2006). Protoceratium reticulatum seems to be a rather typical dinoflagellate with respect to CA activity, with no activity at the surface of the cells and appreciable activity within the cell (Table 3). While the involvement and role of CAs in the CCM of P. reticulatum remain to be clarified, our results indicate that this species contains a soluble, intracellular CA. The fact that protein extracts from P. reticulatum cross-react only with antibodies directed against  $\beta$ -CA, specifically those from Ph. tricornutum (Satoh et al. 2001) and from Coccomyxa sp. (Hiltonen et al. 1995, Hiltonen et al. 1998) and not with antibodies against  $\alpha$ -CA is highly suggestive, albeit not conclusive, of the presence of a  $\beta$ -CA in *P. reticulatum*. The intracellular CA activity in P. reticulatum, as in Ph. tricornutum (Satoh et al. 2001) but not in the obligately lichenized Coccomyxa sp., which lacks a CCM (Hiltonen et al. 1998, Raven et al. 2005), is induced by low  $CO_2$  (Table 3). In addition, the abundance of the protein recognized by anti-PtCA and anti-CoCA is increased in the low- $CO_2$  treatment (Fig. 1), pointing to its implication in a biophysical CCM. It is not currently known how many CAs are present in dinoflagellates; BLAST searches of dinoflagellate expressed sequence tag (EST) libraries retrieve sequences with modest similarity to  $\alpha$ ,  $\beta$ , and  $\gamma$  CAs (expected values typically in the range  $10^{-7}$  to  $10^{-9}$ ).

To estimate the potential contribution of the iCA of *P. reticulatum* to the CCM, we compared the CA-catalyzed rate of  $HCO_3^-$  conversion to  $CO_2$  in cells grown at high- and low- $CO_2$  concentrations (Table 4) with their photosynthetic  $K_{1/2(DIC)}$  (Table 5). These calculations suggest that the one order of magnitude difference in photosynthetic affinity for DIC between the cells grown in high  $CO_2$  and those grown in low  $CO_2$  may be explained by the difference (one order of magnitude) in iCA activity, supporting a role for this CA in the CCM of *P. reticulatum*.

The extent to which the presence of a CCM relieves cells from  $CO_2$  limitation is not easy to determine. Recently, Rost et al. (2006) showed that photosynthesis and growth of three species of marine dinoflagellates were not limited by inorganic carbon, even at high pH. These authors manipulated DIC availability by changing growth pH. Our study differs from that described by Rost and colleagues because our intention was to investigate the effect of  $CO_2$  concentration only, separating it from

the effect of pH, which was kept constant (although other parameters of the inorganic carbon system in solution were allowed to vary). Our approach afforded results that indicate that P. reticulatum photosynthesis and growth are appreciably limited by DIC availability. Obviously, the impossibility of manipulating just one component of the DIC system does not exclude the possibility that the factors that vary in concert with CO<sub>2</sub> availability in the two approaches were responsible for the observed differences. For example, pH variations can influence the availability of essential nutrients, membrane transport processes, and some metabolic functions (Smith and Raven 1979, Raven 1993, Dason et al. 2004), and changes in total DIC and alkalinity may also have some additional uncharacterized effect. It should also be mentioned that because of the aim and design of our work, which was that of describing in classical terms the CCM of P. reticulatum, we subjected our cells to a much larger variation in  $CO_2$  concentrations than did Rost et al. The CCMs of dinoflagellates may require large variations of external  $CO_2$  to show an appreciable repression, and it could be essentially constitutive under natural conditions. If this is the case, the present-day ecological and, possibly, evolutionary significance of the high-CO<sub>2</sub> repression of these mechanisms will become rather obscure. Moreover, a response not dissimilar to that reported here was observed in the same species in an unbuffered medium equilibrated with a gas phase containing 1000 ppm  $CO_2$ (A. Norici, personal communication), a concentration that in some scenarios may occur at the end of this century (Beardall et al. 1998).

At this preliminary stage in the study of dinoflagellate CCMs, very few mechanistic details are known. The DIC species that is acquired appears to be  $CO_{2}$ in species like Amphidinium carterae Hulburt and Heterocapsa oceanica F. Stein (Colman et al. 2002, Dason et al. 2004), and HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> in species like Prorocentrum minimum (Pavill.) J. Schiller, Heterocapsa triquetra Iwataki, G. Hansen et Fukuyo, and Ceratium *lineatum* (Ehrenb.) Cleve (Rost et al. 2006). Bicarbonate also appears to be acquired in some zooxanthellae (Goiran et al. 1996), although some symbiotic dinoflagellates are able to switch from  $HCO_3^-$  uptake to  $CO_2$  use (Leggat et al. 1999, 2002). The pH values attained at end of the pHdrift experiment ( $\sim$ 8.3; Fig. 2) suggest that *P. reticulatum* is a  $CO_2$  user (Maberly 1990).

In conclusion, the data reported here are suggestive of a decisive involvement of CA in *P. reticulatum* CCM and show that for the activity of this CCM, pyrenoids are not required. More in-depth molecular and physiological studies will be required to understand fully the mechanisms and regulation of dinoflagellate CCMs.

We thank Ulf Riebesell, Kiel University, for his help in developing the procedure for expressing CA activities in physiologically relevant units; N. Nassoury and L. Pelletier, Montréal University, for their technical assistance with electron microscopy and immunocytochemistry; and Bjorn Rost, Alfred Wegener Institute, Bremerhaven, for the insights he provided on pH-drift interpretation and for his comments on other parts of the manuscript. Our gratitude especially goes to John A. Raven and Stephen Maberly for their thorough presubmission review of this paper and for their enlightening advice on the interpretation of the data reported here.

- Amoroso, G., Sultemeyer, D., Thyssen, C. & Fock, H. P. 1998. Uptake of  $HCO_3^-$  and  $CO_2$  in cells and chloroplasts from the microalgae *Chlamydomonas reinhardtii* and *Dunaliella tertiolecta*. *Plant Physiol.* 116:193–201.
- Badger, M. K., Andrews, T. J., Whitney, S. M., Ludwig, M., Yellowlees, D. C., Leggat, W. & Price, G. D. 1998. The diversity and coevolution of Rubisco, plastids, pyrenoids, and chloroplastbased CO<sub>2</sub>-concentrating mechanisms in algae. *Can. J. Bot.* 76:1052–71.
- Badger, M. R., Kaplan, A. & Berry, J. A. 1980. Internal inorganic carbon pool of *Chlamydomonas reinhardtii*: evidence for a carbon dioxide concentrating mechanism. *Plant Physiol.* 66:407– 13.
- Badger, M. R. & Price, G. D. 1992. The carbon dioxide concentrating mechanism in cyanobacteria and microalgae. *Physiol. Plant.* 84:606–15.
- Badger, M. R. & Price, G. D. 1994. The role of carbonic anhydrase in photosynthesis. Annu. Rev. Plant Physiol. Plant Mol. Biol. 45:369–92.
- Bassham, J. A. & Calvin, M. 1957. The Path of Carbon in Photosynthesis. Prentice-Hall, Englewood Cliffs, New Jersey, 104 pp.
- Beardall, J., Beer, S. & Raven, J. A. 1998. Biodiversity of marine plants in an era of climate change: some predictions on the basis of physiological performance. *Bot. Mar.* 41:113–23.
- Berman-Frank, I., Erez, J. & Kaplan, A. 1998. Growth of dinoflagellates as induced by the availability of CO<sub>2</sub> and inorganic carbon uptake in lake system. *Can. J. Bot.* 76:1043–51.
- Berman-Frank, I., Kaplan, A., Zohary, T. & Dubinsky, Z. 1995. Carbonic anhydrase activity in bloom-forming dinoflagellate *Peridinium. J. Phycol.* 31:906–13.
- Berman-Frank, İ., Zohary, T., Erez, J. & Dubinsky, Z. 1994. CO<sub>2</sub> availability, carbonic anhydrase, and the annual dinoflagellate bloom in Lake Kinneret. *Limnol. Oceanogr.* 39:1822–34.
- Bowes, G., Ogren, W. L. & Hageman, R. 1971. Phosphoglycolate production catalysed by ribulose disphosphate carboxylase. *Biochem. Biophys. Res. Commun.* 45:716–22.
- Burkholder, J. M., Glasgow, H. B. & Deamer-Melia, N. 2001. Overview and present status of the toxic *Pfiesteria* complex (Dinophyceae). *Phycologia* 40:186–214.
- Burnell, J. N. & Hatch, M. D. 1988. Low bundle sheath carbonic anhydrase is apparently essential for effective C<sub>4</sub> pathway operation. *Plant Physiol.* 86:1252–6.
- Calvin, M. & Benson, A. A. 1948. The path of carbon in photosynthesis. *Science* 107:476–80.
- Ciminiello, P., Dell'Aversano, C., Fattorusso, E., Forino, M., Magno, S., Guerrini, F., Pistocchi, R. & Boni, L. 2003. Complex yessotoxin profile in *Protoceratium reticulatum* from northwestern Adriatic sea revealed by LC-MS analysis. *Toxicon* 42:7– 14.
- Clark, D. R. & Flynn, K. J. 2000. The relationship between the dissolved inorganic carbon concentration and growth rate in marine phytoplankton. *Proc. R. Soc. Lond. B Biol. Sci.* 267:953– 9.
- Colman, B., Huertas, E. I., Bhatti, S. & Dason, J. S. 2002. The diversity of inorganic acquisition mechanisms in eukaryotic microalgae. *Funct. Plant Biol.* 29:261–70.
- Cook, J. R., Haggard, S. S. & Harris, P. 1976. Cyclic changes in chloroplast structure in synchronized *Euglena gracilis*. J. Protozool. 23:368–73.
- Dason, J. S., Huertas, E. I. & Colman, B. 2004. Source of inorganic carbon for photosynthesis in two marine dinoflagellates. *J. Phycol.* 40:285–92.

- Dodge, J. D. 1975. A survey of chloroplast ultrastructure in the Dinophyceae. *Phycologia* 14:253–63.
- Draisci, R., Ferretti, É., Palleschi, L., Marchiafava, C., Poletti, R., Milandri, A., Ceredi, A. & Pompei, M. 1999. High levels of yessotoxin and homoyessotoxin in dinoflagellates of the Adriatic sea. *Toxicon* 37:1187–93.
- Giordano, M., Beardall, J. & Raven, J. A. 2005. CO<sub>2</sub> concentrating mechanisms in algae: mechanisms, environmental modulation, and evolution. *Annu. Rev. Physiol.* 56:99–131.
- Giordano, M. & Bowes, G. 1997. Gas exchange and C allocation in *Dunaliella salina* cells in response to the N source and  $CO_2$ concentration used for growth. *Plant Physiol.* 115:1049–56.
- Giordano, M. & Maberly, S. C. 1989. Distribution of carbonic anhydrase in British marine macroalgae. *Oecologia* 81:534–9.
- Godhe, A. & McQuoid, M. R. 2003. Influence of benthic and pelagic environmental factors on the distribution of dinoflagellate cysts in surface sediments along the Swedish west coast. Aquat. Microb. Ecol. 32:185–201.
- Goh, N., Hikaru, S. & Ichiro, I. 2002. Seasonal distribution of species of the toxic dinoflagellate genus *Dinophysis* in Maizuru Bay (Japan), with comments on their autofluorescence and attachment of picophytoplankton. *Harmful Algae* 1:253–64.
- Goiran, C., Al-Moghrabi, S., Allemand, D. & Jaubert, J. 1996. Inorganic carbon uptake for photosynthesis by the symbiotic coral/dinoflagellates association. I. Photosynthesis performances of symbionts and dependence on seawater bicarbonate. J. Exp. Mar. Biol. Ecol. 199:207–25.
- Goodson, M. S., Whitehead, L. F. & Douglas, A. E. 2001. Symbiotic dinoflagellates in marine *Cnidaria*: diversity and function. *Hydrobiologia* 461:79–82.
- Goyet, C. & Poisson, A. 1989. New determination of carbonic acid dissociation constants in seawater as a function of temperature and salinity. *Deep-Sea Res. Part I Oceanogr. Res. Pap.* 36:1635–54.
- Graham, D., Reed, M. L., Patterson, B. D. & Hockley, D. G. 1984. Chemical properties, distribution, and physiology of plant and algal carbonic anhydrases. *Ann. N. Y. Acad. Sci.* 429: 222–37.
- Guillard, R. R. L. & Hargraves, P. E. 1993. Stichochrysis immobilis is a diatom, not a chrysophyte. *Phycologia* 32:234–6.
- Hatch, M. D. & Burnell, J. N. 1990. Carbonic anhydrase activity in leaves and its role in the first step of C<sub>4</sub> photosynthesis. *Plant Physiol.* 93:825–8.
- Hiltonen, T., Biörkbacka, H., Forsman, C., Clarke, A. K. & Samuelsson, G. 1998. Intracellular β-carbonic anhydrase of the unicellular green alga *Coccomyxa*. Cloning of the cDNA and characterization of the functional enzyme overexpressed in *Escherichia coli*. *Plant Physiol*. 117:1341–9.
- Hiltonen, T., Karlsson, J., Palmqvist, K., Clarke, A. K. & Samuelsson, G. 1995. Purification and characterisation of an intracellular carbonic anhydrase from the unicellular green alga *Coccomyxa*. *Planta* 195:345–51.
- Horstman, D. A. 1980. Reported red-water outbreaks and their effects on fauna of the west and south coasts of South Africa, 1959–1980. Fish. Bull. South Africa 15:71–88.
- Jeffrey, S. W. & Humphrey, G. F. 1975. New spectrophotometer equations for determining chlorophylls a, b, c<sub>1</sub>, c<sub>2</sub> in higher plants, algae, and natural phytoplankton. *Biochem. Physiol. Pflanz.* 167:191–4.
- Jenks, A. & Gibbs, S. P. 2000. Immunolocalization and distribution of form II Rubisco in the pyrenoids and chloroplast stroma of *Amphidinium carterae* and form I Rubisco in the symbiontderived plastids of *Peridinium foliaceum* (Dinophyceae). J. Phycol. 36:127–38.
- Johansson, I.-M. & Forsman, C. 1993. Kinetic studies of pea carbonic anhydrase. Eur. J. Biochem. 218:439–46.
- Joyce, L. B. 2004. Dinoflagellate cysts in recent marine sediments from Scapa Flow, Orkney, Scotland. *Bot. Mar.* 47:173–83.
- Juhl, A. R. & Latz, M. I. 2002. Mechanisms of fluid shear-induced inhibition of population growth in a red-tide dinoflagellate. *J. Phycol.* 38:683–94.
- Karlsson, J., Hiltonen, T., Husic, D. H., Ramazanov, Z. & Samuelsson, G. 1995. Intracellular carbonic anhydrase of *Chlamydomonas reinhardtii. Plant Physiol.* 109:533–9.

- Laemmli, U. K. 1970. Cleavage of the structural protein during the assembly of the head of the bacteriophage T4. *Nature* 227:680–5.
- Leggat, W., Badger, M. R. & Yellowlees, D. 1999. Evidence for an inorganic carbon-concentrating mechanism in the symbiotic dinoflagellate *Symbiodinium* sp. *Plant Physiol.* 121:1247–55.
- Leggat, W., Marendy, E. M., Baillie, B., Whitney, S. M., Ludwig, M., Badger, M. R. & Yellowlees, D. 2002. Dinoflagellates symbiosis: strategies and adaptations for the acquisition and fixation of inorganic carbon. *Funct. Plant Biol.* 29:309–22.
- Maberly, S. C. 1990. Exogenous sources of inorganic carbon for photosynthesis by marine microalgae. J. Phycol. 26:439–49.
- Maberly, S. C. 1996. Diel, episodic and seasonal changes in pH and concentrations of inorganic carbon in a productive lake. *Freshw. Biol.* 35:579–98.
- Maclean, J. L. 1989. Indo-Pacific red tides, 1985–1988. Mar. Pollut. Bull. 20:304–10.
- McAlice, B. J. 1971. Phytoplankton sampling with the Sedgwick-Rafter cell. *Limnol. Oceanogr.* 16:19–28.
- Miyachi, S., Tsuzuki, M. & Avramova, T. 1983. Utilization modes of inorganic carbon for photosynthesis in various species of *Chlorella. Plant Cell Physiol.* 24:441–51.
- Morita, E., Toshihiko, A., Tsuzuki, M., Fujiwara, S., Sato, N., Hirata, A., Sonoike, K. & Nozaki, H. 1998. Presence of the CO<sub>2</sub>concentrating mechanism in some species of the pyrenoid-less free-living algal genus *Chloromonas* (Volvocales, Chlorophyta). *Planta* 204:269–76.
- Morono, A., Arevalo, F., Fernandez, M. L., Maneira, J., Pazos, Y., Salgado, C. & Blanco, J. 2003. Accumulation and transformation of DSP toxins in mussels *Mytilus galloprovincialis* during a toxic episode caused by *Dinophysis acuminata*. Aquat. Toxicol. 62:269–80.
- Morse, D., Salois, P., Markovic, P. & Hastings, J. W. 1995. A nuclearencoded form II Rubisco in dinoflagellates. *Science* 268:1622– 4.
- Murata, M., Legrand, A. M., Ishibashi, Y., Fukui, M. & Yasumoto, T. 1990. Structures and configurations of ciguatoxin from the moray eel *Gymnothorax javanicus* and its likely precursor from the dinoflagellate *Gambieridiscus toxicus. J. Am. Chem. Soc.* 112:4380–6.
- Nassoury, N., Fritz, L. & Morse, D. 2001. Circadian changes in ribulose-1,5-bisphosphate carboxylase/oxygenase distribution inside individual chloroplasts can account for the rhythm in dinoflagellate carbon fixation. *Plant Cell* 13:923–34.
- Nassoury, N., Wang, Y. & Morse, D. 2005. Brefeldin A inhibits circadian remodelling of chloroplast structure in the dinoflagellate *Gonyaulax*. *Traffic* 6:548–61.
- Nimer, N. A., Brownlee, C. & Merrett, M. J. 1999a. Extracellular carbonic anhydrase facilitates carbon dioxide availability for photosynthesis in the marine dinoflagellate *Prorocentrum micans. Plant Physiol.* 120:105–11.
- Nimer, N. A., Iglesias-Rodriguez, M. D. & Merrett, M. J. 1997. Bicarbonate utilization by marine phytoplankton species. J. Phycol. 33:625–31.
- Nimer, N. A., Ling, M. X., Brownlee, C. & Merrett, M. J. 1999b. Inorganic carbon limitation, exofacial carbonic anhydrase activity and plasma membrane redox activity in marine phytoplantkon species. J. Phycol. 35:1200–5.
- Peterson, G. L. 1977. Simplification of the protein assay method of Lowry et al. which is more generally applicable. *Anal. Biochem.* 83:346–56.
- Pocker, Y. & Deits, T. L. 1984. Active-site mechanisms of carbonic anhydrases. Ann. N. Y. Acad. Sci. 429:76–83.
- Pocker, Y. & Miksch, R. R. 1978. Plant carbonic anhydrase. Properties and bicarbonate dehydration kinetics. Am. Chem. Soc. 17:1119–25.
- Raven, J. A. 1993. Limits on growth rate. Nature 361:209-10.
- Raven, J. A. 1997a. Putting the C in phycology. *Eur. J. Phycol.* 32:319–33.
- Raven, J. A. 1997b. CO<sub>2</sub>-concentrating mechanisms: a direct role for thylakoid lumen acidification? *Plant Cell Environ.* 20:147– 54.

- Raven, J. A., Ball, L. A., Beardall, J., Giordano, M. & Maberly, S. C. 2005. Algae lacking carbon-concentrating mechanisms. *Can. J. Bot.* 83:879–90.
- Raven, J. A. & Johnston, A. M. 1991. Mechanisms of inorganic carbon acquisition in marine phytoplankton and their implications for the use of other resources. *Limnol. Oceanogr.* 36:1701–17.
- Rost, B., Richter, K., Riebesell, U. & Hansen, P. J. 2006. Inorganic carbon acquisition in red tide dinoflagellates. *Plant Cell Envi*ron. 29:810–22.
- Rost, B., Riebesell, U., Burkhardt, S. & Sultemeyer, D. 2003. Carbon acquisition of bloom-forming marine phytoplankton. *Limnol. Oceanogr.* 48:55–67.
- Rowan, R. 1998. Diversity and ecology of zooxanthellae on coral reefs. J. Phycol. 34:407–17.
- Satoh, D., Hiraoka, Y., Colman, B. & Matsuda, Y. 2001. Physiological and molecular biological characterization of intracellular carbonic anhydrase from the marine diatom *Phaeodactylum tricornutum. Plant Physiol.* 126:1459–70.
- Schnepf, E. & Elbrächter, M. 1999. Dinophyte chloroplasts and phylogeny – a review. Grana 38:81–97.
- Smith, F. A. & Raven, J. A. 1979. Intracellular pH and its regulation. Annu. Rev. Plant Physiol. 30:289–311.
- Taylor, F. J. R. & Pollingher, U. 1987. Ecology of dinoflagellates. In Taylor, F. J. R. [Ed.] The Biology of Dinoflagellates. Botanical Monographs, Vol. 21. Blackwell Scientific, Oxford, UK, pp. 398– 529.
- Weiss, R. F. 1974. Carbon dioxide in water and seawater: the solubility of a non-ideal gas. *Mar. Chem.* 2:203–15.
- Whitney, S. M. & Andrews, T. G. 1998. The CO<sub>2</sub>/O<sub>2</sub> specificity of single subunit ribulose-bisphosphate carboxylase from the dinoflagellate, *Amphidinium carterae*. Aust. J. Plant Physiol. 25:131–8.
- Whitney, S. M. & Yellowlees, D. 1995. Preliminary investigations into the structure and activity of ribulose bisphosphate carboxylase from two photosynthetic dinoflagellates. *J. Phycol.* 31:138–46.
- Wilbur, K. M. & Anderson, N. G. 1948. Electrometric and calorimetric determination of carbonic anhydrase. J. Biol. Chem. 176:147–54.
- Yasumoto, T., Murata, M., Kumagai, M. & Lee, J. S. 1987. Isolation and structure of yessotoxin, a novel polyether compound implicated in diarrhetic shellfish poisoning. *Tetrahedron Lett.* 28:5859–72.
- Yasumoto, T., Murata, M., Oshima, Y. & Sano, M. 1985. Diarrhetic shellfish toxins. *Tetrahedron* 41:1019–25.

## **Supplementary Material**

The following supplementary material is available for this article

**Figure S1.** Plastid ultrastructure in *Protoceratium reticulatum* grown under different [CO<sub>2</sub>] and light cycles.

This material is available as part of the online article from: http://www.blackwell-synergy.com/doi/abs/10.1111/j.1529-8817.2007.00368.x

(This link will take you to the article abstract).

Please note: Blackwell Publishing is not responsible for the content or functionality of any supplementary materials supplied by the authors. Any queries (other than missing material) should be directed to the corresponding author for the article.